

**Town of Charlton
Saratoga County
Town Board Meeting**

December 9, 2019

The Regular Meeting of the Town Board of the Town of Charlton, Saratoga County, New York was held at the Charlton Town Hall, 758 Charlton Rd, Charlton, NY and called to order by Supervisor Grattidge at 7:37 p.m.

Supervisor Grattidge led the pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Councilman Grasso, Councilwoman Heritage, Councilman Ranaletto, Councilman Robbins, Supervisor Grattidge, Town Clerk Brenda Mills, Attorney Craig.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

RESOLUTION #197

Approval of Minutes

Motion by Councilman Ranaletto

Seconded by Councilwoman Heritage

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board has approved the minutes of the Public Hearing regarding the Verizon EUP application on November 25, 2019.

Vote: All Ayes, No Nays. **CARRIED**

RESOLUTION #198

Approval of Minutes

Motion by Councilman Robbins

Seconded by Councilman Grasso

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board has approved the minutes of the Town Board Agenda Meeting on November 25, 2019.

Vote: All Ayes, No Nays. **CARRIED**

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR FOR AGENDA ITEMS

No one chose to speak.

TOWN CLERK'S REPORT

The Town Clerk's office took in \$478,000 for the month of November. \$329.80 was paid to the Supervisor's office, and \$148.20 was paid to other Governmental agencies.

RESOLUTION #199

Acceptance of the Town Clerk's Report

Motion by Councilman Grasso

Seconded by Councilman Ranaletto

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board has accepted the Town Clerk's report as read.

Vote: All Ayes, No Nays. **CARRIED**

SUPERVISORS REPORT

For the month of November, I attended 4 Town meetings and 6 County meetings.
Some of the highlights of the month:

- Attended normal Town and County meetings
- Held a Public Hearing on the Cell Tower Project
- Worked on the 2020 County Budget

Supervisor Grattidge confirmed that the Town Board received the Financial Report for the month, and the Key Bank Custodial Statement.

(see financial report on next page)

12/05/2019 11:11:27

MONTHLY REPORT OF SUPERVISOR

TO THE TOWN BOARD OF THE TOWN OF CHARLTON :

Pursuant to Section 125 of the Town Law, I hereby render the following detailed statement of all moneys received and disbursed by me during the month of November, 2019:

DATED: December 5, 2019

SUPERVISOR

	Balance 10/31/2019	Increases	Decreases	Balance 11/30/2019
A GENERAL FUND - TOWNWIDE				
CASH - CHECKING	28,773.93	70,009.18	70,007.96	28,775.15
CASH - SAVING	111,558.61	139,258.13	70,007.96	180,808.78
PETTY CASH	500.00	0.00	0.00	500.00
Park Fees Reserve	43,034.44	15.64	0.00	43,050.08
TOTAL	183,866.98	209,282.95	140,015.92	253,134.01
DA HIGHWAY FUND				
CASH - CHECKING	197.25	80,997.26	80,893.11	301.40
CASH - SAVINGS	120,391.41	72,114.66	80,893.11	111,612.96
CASH, SPECIAL RESERVE	15,500.35	0.00	0.00	15,500.35
TOTAL	136,089.01	153,111.92	161,786.22	127,414.71
F WATER #1 FUND				
CASH - CHECKING	33.54	8,732.95	8,732.95	33.54
CASH - SAVINGS	302,496.68	111.68	8,732.95	293,875.41
CASH, SPECIAL RESERVES	200,072.86	2.07	0.00	200,074.93
TOTAL	502,603.08	8,846.70	17,465.90	493,983.88
SW WATER #2 FUND				
CASH - CHECKING	0.00	219.74	219.74	0.00
CASH - SAVINGS	27,437.66	11.17	219.74	27,229.09
TOTAL	27,437.66	230.91	439.48	27,229.09
TA TRUST & AGENCY				
CASH - CHECKING	11,367.34	40,199.01	37,859.01	13,707.34
TOTAL	11,367.34	40,199.01	37,859.01	13,707.34
H CAPITAL PROJECTS				
CASH - CHECKING	91,217.00	0.00	0.00	91,217.00
SAVINGS	-42,746.00	0.00	0.00	-42,746.00
TOTAL	48,471.00	0.00	0.00	48,471.00
TOTAL ALL FUNDS	909,835.07	411,671.49	357,566.53	963,940.03

DEPARTMENT, COMMITTEE & COUNCILMAN REPORTS

Highway – Report given by Marshall Heritage:

1. Tree brush clean up from the October 31 wind/rain storm
2. We did leaf pick up
3. Ditching Cook Road
4. Truck # 14 changed 6 tires and changed brakes and drums
5. Mixing salt and sand for the roads
6. Snow plowing and sanding roads
7. Patching pot holes
8. Clearing fire hydrants and catch basins
9. 811 locations - 43
10. I attended the Highway Superintendents' luncheon
11. Cleaning trucks up from the snow storms
12. Truck and sander maintenance

Councilman Robbins said that the Christmas Tree Lighting ceremony on December 8th went well, and was well attended. He thanked Marshall Heritage, Highway Superintendent, and the Highway crew for all of their work to remove snow and get the gazebo ready for the event. Supervisor Grattidge thanked Councilman Robbins for all of the efforts he put into the event, including over 400 luminaries that he prepared and placed along the road. Councilman Grasso thanked Bob Youmans for leading the caroling and Torben Aabo for leading the event.

Historian – Marv Livingston said that a woman offered to donate a horse drawn sleigh that has resided in Charlton for over 100 years, to the Historian for the Town. He declined the offer as the Town has nowhere to store it, and suggested that the woman contact the Charlton Historical Society. Mr. Livingston said that he has been invited to participate in the Ticonderoga Historical Society Women's Suffrage events next August. He has been doing research on Charlton Churches. He provided the names of the Charlton Churches and the years they were started: Charlton Freehold -1786, St. Paul's Episcopal -1804, Charlton Methodist -1831, West Charlton Presbyterian -1792, and St. Mary's Episcopal -1820. The population of the Town of Charlton in 1792 was discussed and a few people thought it was between 1400-1500 residents.

Zoning – In November, 12 Building Permits were issued, \$2,330 in fees were collected, and 4 CCs were issued. The closed permit value was \$49,500.00. Councilman Ranaletto said that he met with Paul Borisenko and Laurie Kruppenbacher in the Zoning Office. They have been working with the new Assistant Zoning Administrator, Terry Anthony and his training is going well. He also noted that the Building Department will require zoning permits for all new Agricultural buildings beginning January 1, 2020. There is no fee for the permit.

BHBL Community Library – Tom Saginaw gave the following report:

The annual Christmas Tree Lighting at the library was a wonderful community event with 240 people in attendance. The library will be closed on December 24, December 25, and January 1. We will close at 2:00 pm on December 31. Thank you to the Charlton Town Board for your support of the library in 2019 and continued support in 2020.

Constables – In November, there were 25 patrols, 26 complaints received, 24 911 calls, 9 accidents, and 8 EMT/Fire call responded to. 22 tickets were issued (7 issued on Route 67).

Dog Control – In November, there were 3 calls received, 1 call was pertaining to other animals and 5 expired licenses followed up on.

Planning Board – Councilman Grasso said that the Board did not meet in November and will not be meeting in December.

CELL TOWER APPLICATION DISCUSSION:

Councilman Grasso said that the Town Board has continued their review of the cell tower application. They have received letters from residents regarding the proposed cell tower, and he read them into the record:

Paul and Nanette Nikiforiv writes;

November 21, 2019

Town of Charlton Town Board
758 Charlton Road
Charlton, NY 12019

Dear Board Members:

We are writing to you to express our concern and opposition to a variance being considered on November 25, 2019 to allow CELLCO to erect a 124-ft. cell tower adjacent to our property. Our property is tax parcel 246.-2-23.

Our property is our family home. We, as do most of our neighbors, use our property within the rural and agricultural guidelines that are the essence of Charlton. The town's zoning code speaks to that essence many places throughout the code. A 124-ft. metal tower in the middle of this rural, agricultural, and historical area is certainly not remotely in keeping with the character of the area and the Town in general. "

We understand that CELLCO's application must be in strict compliance with the special conditions and the Board must consider the effect of the variance on the adjacent properties. CELLCO's rendering as part of their application, shows a metal tower that rises almost half again above the natural tree line. This will be the dominant feature of this rural section of Town. How can anyone say this does not adversely affect this section of town? A 124' tower certainly changes and endangers the neighborhood character. Given the choice of the property you would buy for your home would a 124' tower adjacent to the property of one of your choices affect your decision as to which to buy? We believe such a tower will lower the property value of our property and the property values of our neighbors.

We respectfully request the Board deny CELLCO's application for the cell tower at this proposed location and reconsider the water tower location to protect the rural, agricultural and historical nature of the Town we all love.

A favor of a reply would be appreciated.

Thank you.

Sandra Dawes, 11/26 writes: Hi! I wasn't able to attend the meeting for the new cell tower but I do want to say that the Dawes family at 12 Crestwood drive is in favor of a cell tower being put up!! Thank you!!

Michelle Mann, 11/27 writes: In reference to the proposed cell tower. The coverage from this location is not very good. If you look at the coverage maps for towers that are located at higher elevations, they cover MUCH more area. Why are towers being put in areas that can't go very far? The one near Jockey Street and Route 67 doesn't even get past the hills to the west, north and east! The coverage from the proposed tower is small because it can't go over hills. Why not put the tower on the ridge just north of town? I would think the entire town would be covered and others as well. Did anyone ask Verizon if there was a more suitable site that would cover more area??? I don't want the \$\$ paid to the land owner to influence where the tower goes. I want the tower to be placed where it will give the greatest coverage to the most people. The proposed location DOES NOT SEEM very well suited to me.

Ian Feinstein, 11/28 writes: As a resident of Charlton for the past two years, my wife and I have struggled with cell phone service since having purchased our home. We both strongly support the construction of a cell tower. Cell phones are a necessary tool that many of us rely on. We are excited to know that the Board of Selectmen is exploring the needs of its residents and helping to ensure their safety.

David Lovejoy, 12/6 writes: I support installation of the cell phone tower in Charlton as I get no cell phone signal at my home and I have aging parents that live with me that require a signal for medical monitoring.

Richard and Brenda Fox, 12/7 write: We are strongly in favor of the new cell tower. We live on meadow brook Lane and the current cell service is terrible. We are seniors and my husband's health is not good. He has a heart condition and also a pacemaker. We have to go into the doctors' office every few months to make sure it is working. It is possible to give the doctors' office a report every month over the cell phone, unfortunately the cell service we have now does not allow us to do that. We ask ourselves how in this day and age is it possible to live in such a wonderful town and have such bad cell service. Please vote yes for the new cell tower.

Councilman Grasso said that all of these letters should be taken into consideration as well as public hearing comments. He has gone through all of the revised application documents dated 11/22 that Verizon has provided and he feels that they have addressed all of the comments that the Town Board was looking for answers on. He noted that the Visual EAF was not in the packet. He asked Attorney Brennan to forward it, and then would like the Town Clerk to put on the website. There are two actions that the Town Board has to consider. One is the SEQR which must come first. Then they can consider the EUP application. He said that he is comfortable with the application that has been submitted. He does not feel like it is going to result in a significant environmental impact and he does not feel like an environmental impact statement is going to be required. He feels that the Full EAF does a good job evaluating the environmental impact. If the Board agrees, he would start to draft the SEQR negative declaration for the Board's consideration. It has to be a document that the whole Board feels comfortable. As far as a timeframe, he feels that Board is ready to make a SEQR determination which leads to the next decision which is approval of the Exceptional Use Permit application. He feels this is a great site, we have gotten great comments from our residents, he has reviewed them all again, and he has thought long and deeply about those comments, from both people in favor of it and those opposed to it. And he still thinks that this is a great application, a great site and something definitely needed in Town. He is supportive of the application, and he is willing to start drafting the language for the Exceptional Use Application. It will probably take longer to make sure that they get all of the right things in it, and would probably come at a meeting following their SEQR approval. He said that a lot of people have made comments or have concerns about the aesthetics, and he noted that the applicant has mentioned that they are willing to change the color to white, which was the Councilman's suggestion, and also make some modifications to the antenna array at the top. He is not sure that it will be exactly the look that he would like to see, but it is something that he would like to review. He wants to make sure that it is as good as the industry can provide to minimize the visual impact because there are some areas in Town that it is visible from so he feels the Board should do their job to make sure that it is as visually unobtrusive as possible. Councilman Grasso will gather input from each of the Board members individually and prepare a draft SEQR determination for the Town Board's consideration.

Supervisor Grattidge said that it would be great if they could make a decision on SEQR at the next meeting and then take a vote on the Exceptional Use Permit Application at a meeting January.

Supervisor Grattidge asked the Town Assessor, Kim Caron to give an overview of the revaluation project that is scheduled to be done for the 2021 tax roll. Kim read the following details:

The Assessor's Office would like to conduct a reassessment for the town for the 2021 tax roll. I have proposed to do the project over a two year period with fellow assessor, Vicki Hayner. The purpose of this project is to regain equity in the town and make sure all property owners are paying their fair share of taxes. **It is NOT to raise more tax money.**

There will be no extra monies raised for the town with this project. The budget process is a separate process from the reassessment project. The only outcome will be that the tax rates are the lowest they can be and residents are getting the most benefit for their exemptions.

The process begins with a Town Board Resolution in January, 2020 authorizing the reassessment project. Then a workshop with the Town Board, myself and Vicki Hayner will be scheduled to educate the public on this process. Then we will begin the data collection process. We will send data mailers to all of the residents

for them to verify the information we have on record. We will also be doing drive-bys of all of the properties as well as updating all of our pictures. Once all of the data has been collected we will begin valuation of each parcel. The new values will appear on the 2021 tax roll and will affect the 2021-2022 school tax bills and the 2022 county tax bills. Once values have been established, property owners will be notified of their new tentative assessment. We will conduct informal review meetings with all residents that request a meeting to review their tentative assessment. Once the informal review meetings have been completed, the tentative roll will be submitted to the County. Per usual process, Grievance Day will follow for anyone challenging their tentative assessment.

Supervisor Grattidge clarified that the revaluation would begin in 2020 and the new values will be in place in March of 2021. If any resident has concerns about their new value, they will have informal review hearings before grievance day so if they still have concerns they can grieve at Grievance Day. Councilman Grasso said that he feels that this is an important step for the Town, especially since our equalization rate is 66%. He finds that most people are indifferent about a revaluation, mostly because they do not understand it, so he feels that public dialogue and answering people's questions is important. He suggested putting frequently asked questions and answers on the Town website. He supports going through the process. He confirmed with Kim Caron that most of the information will be gathered by drivebys, pictometry, aerial views, resident data information etc. He said that he has heard from people in the Ag industry that there is more of a tax burden on the farmers. One thing that we do not allow in this Town is the application of ag exemptions to the special district taxes (ambulance tax, fire tax). That is something that he is a strong advocate for. Other Towns have done it and he would like us to research it. He would like the amounts quantified to see the impact, as every time that you give an exemption to someone, you shift the burden to someone else. Supervisor Grattidge said that there will be a public information meeting in February or March and maybe New York State would send someone to help explain the process. Information will be in the spring newsletter explaining the process and should be put on the Town website. He said as far as he remembers the last reval was about 20 years ago.

MOTIONS, RESOLUTIONS, AND AUTHORIZATIONS

RESOLUTION # 200

RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE THE TAX COLLECTOR TO PURCHASE UPGRADED TAX COLLECTION SOFTWARE FOR THE PURPOSE OF ONLINE VIEWING AND CREDITCARD PAYMENTS

Motion by Councilman Ranaletto

Seconded by Councilman Grasso

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board hereby authorizes the Tax Collector to purchase upgraded Tax Collection software from BAS at a total cost of \$1,524.95.

Roll Call: Councilman Grasso: Aye, Councilwoman Heritage: Absent, Councilman Ranaletto: Aye, Councilman Robbins: Aye, Supervisor Grattidge: Aye. **CARRIED**

ABSTRACT OF CLAIMS

RESOLUTION #201

Approval of Abstract of Claims

Motion by Councilwoman Heritage

Seconded by Councilman Robbins

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board audited Abstract #121, voucher numbers 756-793 in the amount of \$33,031.74 and Abstract #23, voucher number 2301 in the amount of \$7,153.87.

Vote: All Ayes, No Nays. **CARRIED**

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

No one chose to speak.

The meeting adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Brenda Mills
Town Clerk